



Student Tasks:

- Read argumentative samples and identify counterarguments
- Evaluate the effectiveness of opposing arguments
- Provide feedback on samples using feedback stems

Online ThinkCERCA Resources

- Close Reading & Writing Lessons
- Writing Benchmarks

On the Counter

Evaluate the effectiveness of counterclaims and provide feedback for revisions

Suggested Time: 30 minutes

Rationale/Research Base

Allowing students to evaluate the writing of others, specifically counterclaims, gives them exposure to varying levels of proficiency in writing they do not get by analyzing only professional texts. When they go through the act of evaluating counterclaims and selecting appropriate feedback, they can then transfer that learning to their own writing.

Optimal Application Notes:

Students will need multiple argumentative student samples to evaluate. You can utilize benchmark writing students have already done or select from provided samples from [grades 3-8](#) or [grades 9-12](#) here. For this activity, it's best that students receive only the writing and not the rubric category scores as that could interfere with their evaluation.

Before:

- Determine if you will print the Claim/Counterclaim pages of the Revision Stems or share them digitally for students to reference. Find Revision Stems for [grades 6-8](#) or [grades 9-12](#) here.
- Explain the steps and objectives of the On the Counter activity.

During:

- Students work independently to read each sample, identify the counterclaim, select an appropriate feedback stem based on the counterclaim's effectiveness, then provide feedback on the counterclaim using their selected feedback stem.
- Circulate the room to monitor student's accuracy on finding the counterclaims and provide feedback on the feedback they wrote.
- If students finish evaluating their samples at different times, consider giving them other samples to evaluate.

After:

- Lead students through a discussion on which feedback stems they were selecting most often, how a strong counter impacts the overall argument, or what they now think should be included in a strong counterargument.
- Consider providing the rubric scores for the samples they evaluated so students can compare their feedback with the actual scores.

Scaffolds & Supports:

- Consider providing rubric scores for students still struggling with writing and only having them write the feedback response for the stem associated with that score.
- Consider allowing students struggling with writing to work in heterogeneous pairs.

On the Counter

Instructions: Follow the steps below to read each argumentative student sample, identify the counterclaim, select an appropriate feedback stem based on the effectiveness of the counterclaim, and provide a piece of feedback on the counterclaim using their selected feedback stem.

Review:

- Review what you know about the purpose and delivery of a counterargument in an argumentative essay.
- Review the reading passage/s associated with your student samples if necessary.

Guidelines for Vocabulary Telephone:

- **Prepare Materials:** Make sure you have the correct number of samples you are supposed to evaluate and that each sample is different. Ensure you have access to the Revision Stems.
- **Begin:** Read your first student sample. After reading, highlight or use a utensil to mark where the student introduced counterclaims or opposing arguments. Look through the “Traits” column for Claim/Counterclaim on the Revision Stems and determine what score this sample should earn on their counterclaim. Then, use the feedback stem in the right column for that score to write a piece of feedback on the sample about their counterclaim and how they might improve it.
- **Repeat:** Repeat the process above for each of the student samples your teacher provided.
- **Reflect and Discuss:** After the you finish, consider which feedback stems you selected most often, how a strong counter impacts the overall argument, or what you now think should be included in a strong counterargument.

Extension Activity (Optional):

- Consider looking at the actual rubric scores for the samples you evaluated so you can compare your feedback with the actual scores.